Milos - June 2011

## Holographic superconductors at low temperatures

## **GEORGE SIOPSIS**

The University of Tennessee

## <u>OUTLINE</u>

- Hairy black holes
- Low temperatures
- Conductivity
- Varying q
- Conclusions

◊ G. S. and J. Therrien, JHEP 1005 (2010) 013 [arXiv:1003.4275]

◊ G. S., J. Therrien, and S. Musiri, arXiv:1011.2938

◊ J. Alsup, G. S., and J. Therrien, in preparation

# Hairy black holes

We are interested in the dynamics of a scalar field of mass m and electric charge q coupled to a U(1) vector potential in the backgound of a d + 1 - dimensional AdS black hole. The action is

$$S = \int d^{d+1} \sqrt{-g} \left[ \frac{R - 2\Lambda}{16\pi G} - \frac{1}{4} F_{\mu\nu} F^{\mu\nu} - |(\partial_{\mu} - iqA_{\mu})\Psi|^2 - m^2 |\Psi|^2 \right]$$

where F = dA. We shall adopt units in which  $\Lambda = -\frac{d(d-1)}{2}$ ,  $8\pi G = 1$ .

To find a solution of the field equations, consider the metric *ansatz* 

$$ds^{2} = \frac{1}{z^{2}} \left[ -f(z)e^{-\chi(z)}dt^{2} + d\vec{x}^{2} + \frac{dz^{2}}{f(z)} \right]$$

where  $\vec{x} \in \mathbb{R}^{d-1}$ , representing an AdS black hole of planar horizon.

- AdS boundary at z = 0.
- choose units so that the horizon is at  $z = 1, \therefore$  require f(1) = 0.
  - possible because of scaling symmetries of the system and can be done without loss of generality as long as one is careful to only consider physical quantities which are scale invariant.

Hawking temperature

$$T = -\frac{f'(1)}{4\pi}e^{-\chi(1)/2}$$

Assume scalar field is *real* function  $\Psi(z)$ , and potential is an electrostatic scalar potential,  $A = \Phi(z)dt$ .

► field equations are

$$\begin{split} \Psi'' + \left[\frac{f'}{f} - \frac{\chi'}{2} - \frac{d-1}{z}\right]\Psi' + \left[\frac{q^2\Phi^2 e^{\chi}}{f^2} - \frac{m^2}{z^2 f}\right]\Psi &= 0\\ \Phi'' + \left[\frac{\chi'}{2} - \frac{d-3}{z}\right]\Phi' - \frac{2q^2\Psi^2}{z^2 f}\Phi &= 0\\ -\frac{d-1}{2}\chi' + z\Psi'^2 + \frac{zq^2\Phi^2\Psi^2}{f^2}e^{\chi} &= 0\\ \frac{f}{2}\Psi'^2 + \frac{z^2}{4}\Phi'^2 e^{\chi} - \frac{d-1}{2}\frac{f'}{z} + \frac{d(d-1)}{2}\frac{f-1}{z^2} + \frac{m^2\Psi^2}{2z^2} + \frac{q^2\Psi^2\Phi^2 e^{\chi}}{2f} &= 0 \end{split}$$

[Hartnoll, Herzog, Horowitz]

where  $z \in [0, 1]$  (z = 1 is horizon, z = 0 is boundary).

We are interested in solving the system of non-linear equations in the limit of large q (probe limit).

**George Siopsis** 

• expand the fields as series in 1/q:

$$\Psi = \frac{1}{q} \left[ \Psi_0 + \Psi_1 \frac{1}{q^2} + \dots \right]$$
  

$$\Phi = \frac{1}{q} \left[ \Phi_0 + \Phi_1 \frac{1}{q^2} + \dots \right]$$
  

$$f = f_0 + f_1 \frac{1}{q^2} + \dots$$
  

$$\chi = \chi_0 + \chi_1 \frac{1}{q^2} + \dots$$

► consider the zeroth order system  $(q \to \infty)$  first and then add first-order  $(\mathcal{O}(1/q^2))$  corrections in order to obtain a physically sensible system.

Near the boundary (z  $\rightarrow$  0), we have  $f \rightarrow$  1,  $\chi \rightarrow$  0 and so

$$\Psi pprox \Psi^{(\pm)} z^{\Delta_{\pm}} \ , \quad \Phi pprox \mu - 
ho z^{d-2} \ , \quad \Delta_{\pm} = rac{d}{2} \pm \sqrt{rac{d^2}{4} + m^2}$$

While a linear combination of asymptotics is allowed by the field equations, it turns out that any such combination is unstable.

Hertog and Maeda

**George Siopsis** 

٦

if the horizon has negative curvature, such linear combinations lead to stable configurations in certain cases.

Koutsoumbas, Papantonopoulos, Siopsis

system is labeled uniquely by the dimension  $\Delta = \Delta_{\pm}$ .

• The mass of the scalar field is bounded from below by the BF bound

$$m^2 \ge -\frac{d^2}{4}$$

- there appears to be a quantum phase transition at  $m^2 = 0$ .
- There is also a unitarity bound that requires  $\Delta > \frac{d-2}{2}$ .

 $\mu\left(\rho\right)$  is the chemical potential (charge density) of the dual theory on the boundary.

leading coefficient in the expansion of the scalar yields vacuum expectation values of operators of dimension  $\Delta_{\pm},$ 

$$\langle \mathcal{O}_{\Delta_{\pm}} \rangle = \sqrt{2} \Psi^{(\pm)}$$

The field equations admit non-vanishing solutions for the scalar below a critical temperature  $T_c$  where these operators condense.

### define

$$\Psi(z) = \frac{1}{\sqrt{2q}} b^{\Delta} z^{\Delta} F(z) , \quad b = \langle q \mathcal{O}_{\Delta} \rangle^{1/\Delta}$$

with F(0) = 1.

Above the critical temperature,  $\Psi = 0$ ,

: field equations are solved by the AdS RN black hole with flat horizon,

$$f(z) = 1 - \left(1 + \frac{(d-2)\rho^2}{4}\right) z^d + \frac{(d-2)\rho^2}{4} z^{2(d-1)} , \quad \chi(z) = 0 , \quad \Phi(z) = \rho \left(1 - z^{d-2}\right)$$

Hawking temperature

$$T = \frac{d}{4\pi} \left[ 1 - \frac{(d-2)^2 \rho^2}{4d} \right]$$

scale-invariant quantity (reduced critical temperature)

$$\widehat{T} = \frac{T}{(q\rho)^{1/(d-1)}}$$

At the critical temperature, scalar field equation in RN background with  $\rho = \rho_c$ ,

$$F'' + \left[\frac{f'}{f} + \frac{2\Delta + 1 - d}{z}\right]F' + \left[\Delta\frac{(d - \Delta)(1 - f) + zf'}{z^2f} + q^2\rho_c^2\frac{(1 - z^{d-2})^2}{f^2}\right]F = 0$$

For a given q,  $\rho_c$  is an eigenvalue.

To solve for large q (probe limit), expand

$$F = F_0 + F_1 \frac{1}{q^2} + \dots , \quad \rho = \frac{1}{q} \left[ \rho_0 + \rho_1 \frac{1}{q^2} + \dots \right]$$

At zeroth order ( $q \rightarrow \infty$  limit), RN background turns into an AdS Schwarzschild black hole, so

$$f_0(z) = 1 - z^d$$
,  $\chi_0 = 0$ 

: scalar field equation at critical temperature

$$-F_0'' + \frac{1}{z} \left[ \frac{d}{1-z^d} - 2\Delta - 1 \right] F_0' + \Delta^2 \frac{z^{d-2}}{1-z^d} F_0 = \rho_{0c}^2 \frac{(1-z^{d-2})^2}{(1-z^d)^2} F_0$$

eigenvalue  $\rho_{0c}^2$  minimizes

$$\rho_{0c}^{2} = \frac{\int_{0}^{1} dz \, z^{2\Delta - d + 1} \{ (1 - z^{d}) [F'_{0}(z)]^{2} + \Delta^{2} z^{d - 2} [F_{0}(z)]^{2} \}}{\int_{0}^{1} dz \, z^{2\Delta - d + 1} \frac{(1 - z^{d - 2})^{2}}{1 - z^{d}} [F_{0}(z)]^{2}}$$

estimate by substituting the trial function

$$F_0 = F_\alpha(z) \equiv 1 - \alpha z^{d-1}$$

For d = 3 and  $\Delta = 1, 2$ , we obtain, respectively,

$$ho_{0c}^2 \approx 1.27, \ 17.3 \ , \quad T_c \approx 0.225 \sqrt{q 
ho}, \ 0.117 \sqrt{q 
ho}$$

in very good agreement with the exact  $T_c = 0.226\sqrt{q\rho}$ ,  $0.118\sqrt{q\rho}$ .

For  $\Delta = \frac{d}{2}$  and d = 3, 4, we obtain, respectively,

$$ho_{0c}^2 \approx 6.3, \ 4.2 \ , \quad T_c \approx 0.15 \sqrt{q\rho}, \ 0.2 (q\rho)^{1/3}$$

in very good agreement with the exact  $T_c = 0.15\sqrt{q\rho}$ ,  $0.25(q\rho)^{1/3}$ .



The critical temperature  $T_c$  vs the scaling dimension  $\Delta$  for d = 3 (left panel) and d = 4 (right panel). Data points represent exact values; solid line is obtained with trial function.

 $T < T_c, \ d = 3$ 

Maxwell equation

$$\Phi_0'' = \frac{\langle \mathcal{O}_{\Delta} \rangle^2}{2} \frac{z^{2(\Delta - 1)} F_0^2(z)}{1 - z^3} \Phi_0$$

Right below  $T_c$ ,  $\langle \mathcal{O}_{\Delta} \rangle$  is small. If we write

$$\Phi_0 = \rho_{0c}(1-z) + \frac{\langle \mathcal{O}_{\Delta} \rangle^2}{2} \delta \Phi_0 + \dots$$

we have

$$\delta \Phi_0'' \approx \rho_{0c} \frac{z^{2(\Delta - 1)} F_0^2(z)}{1 + z + z^2}$$

Integrating, we obtain

$$\rho = -\Phi_0'(0) \approx \rho_{0c} \left[ 1 + \frac{\langle \mathcal{O}_{\Delta} \rangle^2}{2} \mathcal{C} \right] \quad , \quad \mathcal{C} = \int_0^1 dz \frac{z^{2(\Delta - 1)} F_0^2(z)}{1 + z + z^2}$$

therefore the condensate,

$$\langle \mathcal{O}_{\Delta} \rangle \approx \gamma T_c^{\Delta} \sqrt{1 - \frac{T}{T_c}} , \quad \gamma = \frac{2}{\sqrt{\mathcal{C}}} \left(\frac{4\pi}{3}\right)^{\Delta}$$

Using trial functions, we obtain for  $\Delta = 1(2)$ ,  $\gamma \approx 11.4(133)$  to be compared with exact  $\gamma = 9.3(144)$ .



 $\gamma$  vs.  $\Delta$  in d = 3

 $\gamma \rightarrow \infty$  as  $\Delta \rightarrow 3$  (*Quantum critical point?*)

## Low temperatures



Left panel: d = 3, right panel: d = 4.

[Horowitz and Roberts]

## **Analytic calculation**

In the zero temperature limit, since radius of horizon is fixed (z = 1), we have  $\hat{T} \rightarrow 0$  whereas T is bounded.

 $\therefore \rho \to \infty, b \to \infty.$ 

We are interested in calculating scale-invariant quantities, such as

$$rac{\langle \mathcal{O} 
angle^{1/\Delta}}{T_c} \sim rac{b}{(q
ho)^{1/(d-1)}}$$

In the probe limit,  $F_0(z)$  has a smooth limit as  $T \to 0$  for  $\Delta = \Delta_- \leq \frac{d}{2}$ .

 $\diamond$  not the case for  $\Delta = \Delta_+ > \frac{d}{2}$  and care should be exercised in taking the  $T \rightarrow 0$  limit in that case.

system of zeroth-order equations,

$$-F_0'' + \frac{1}{z} \left[ \frac{d}{1 - z^d} - 1 - 2\Delta \right] F_0' + \frac{\Delta^2 z^{d-2}}{1 - z^d} F_0 - \frac{1}{(1 - z^d)^2} \Phi_0^2 F_0 = 0$$
  
$$\Phi_0'' - \frac{d - 3}{z} \Phi_0' - \frac{b^{2\Delta} z^{2(\Delta - 1)}}{1 - z^d} F_0^2 \Phi_0 = 0$$

**George Siopsis** 

solve perturbatively at low temperatures ( $b \rightarrow \infty$  limit). re-write as

$$-F_0'' + \frac{1}{z} \left[ \frac{d}{1-z^d} - 1 - 2\Delta \right] F_0' + \frac{\Delta^2}{1-z^d} z^{d-2} F_0 - \frac{1}{(1-z^d)^2} \Phi_0^2 = \frac{1}{(1-z^d)^2} \Phi_0^2 (F_0 - 1) \Phi_0'' - \frac{d-3}{z} \Phi_0' - b^{2\Delta} z^{2(\Delta - 1)} \Phi_0 = \frac{(bz)^{2\Delta} \Phi_0}{1-z^d} \left[ F_0^2 - 1 + z^{d-2} \right]$$

and treat the right-hand side as a perturbation. We obtain  $F_0$  and  $\Phi_0$  as series expansions,

$$F_0(z) = F_0^{(0)}(z) + F_0^{(1)}(z) + \dots , \quad \Phi_0(z) = \Phi_0^{(0)}(z) + \Phi_0^{(1)}(z) + \dots$$

The zeroth-order solution for the electrostatic potential is

$$\Phi_{0}^{(0)}(z) = c(bz)^{\frac{d-2}{2}} \left[ K_{\nu} \left( \frac{(bz)^{\Delta}}{\Delta} \right) - \frac{K_{\nu} \left( \frac{b^{\Delta}}{\Delta} \right)}{I_{\nu} \left( \frac{b^{\Delta}}{\Delta} \right)} I_{\nu} \left( \frac{(bz)^{\Delta}}{\Delta} \right) \right] \quad , \quad \nu = \frac{d-2}{2\Delta}$$

second Bessel function has an exponentially small coefficient,  $\mathcal{O}(\sim e^{-2b^{\Delta}/\Delta})$ , and can be neglected at low temperatures.

The normalization constant c in is related to the chemical potential  $\mu$  and

#### **George Siopsis**

charge density  $\rho$ ,

$$\mu = \frac{c}{2} \Gamma\left(\frac{d-2}{2\Delta}\right) (2\Delta)^{\frac{d-2}{2\Delta}} , \quad \frac{\rho_0}{b^{d-2}} = -\frac{c}{2} \Gamma\left(-\frac{d-2}{2\Delta}\right) (2\Delta)^{-\frac{d-2}{2\Delta}}$$

For the scalar field we obtain

$$F_0^{(0)}(z) = \mathcal{F}_1(z) \left[ 1 + \int_0^z \frac{dz'}{1 - (z')^d} (z')^{2\Delta + 1 - d} \mathcal{F}_2(z') [\Phi_0^{(0)}(z')]^2 \right] \\ - \mathcal{F}_2(z) \int_0^z \frac{dz'}{1 - (z')^d} (z')^{2\Delta + 1 - d} \mathcal{F}_1(z') [\Phi_0^{(0)}(z')]^2$$

where

$$\mathcal{F}_1(z) = F\left(\frac{\Delta}{d}, \frac{\Delta}{d}; \frac{2\Delta}{d}; z^d\right), \quad \mathcal{F}_2(z) = \frac{z^{d-2\Delta}}{d-2\Delta} F\left(1 - \frac{\Delta}{d}, 1 - \frac{\Delta}{d}; 2 - \frac{2\Delta}{d}; z^d\right)$$

logarithmic singularity at the horizon:

$$\mathcal{F}_{1}(z) \approx -\frac{\Gamma(\frac{2\Delta}{d})}{\Gamma^{2}(\frac{\Delta}{d})}\ln(1-z) , \quad \mathcal{F}_{2}(z) \approx -\frac{\Gamma(2-\frac{2\Delta}{d})}{(d-2\Delta)\Gamma^{2}(1-\frac{\Delta}{d})}\ln(1-z)$$
$$F_{0}^{(0)}(z) \approx -\left[\frac{\Gamma(\frac{2\Delta}{d})}{\Gamma^{2}(\frac{\Delta}{d})}(1+c^{2}a_{2}) - \frac{\Gamma(2-\frac{2\Delta}{d})}{(d-2\Delta)\Gamma^{2}(1-\frac{\Delta}{d})}c^{2}a_{1}\right]\ln(1-z)$$

**George Siopsis** 

where

$$a_{i} = \int_{0}^{1} \frac{dz}{1 - z^{d}} z^{2\Delta + 1 - d} \mathcal{F}_{i}(z) \left[\frac{1}{c} \Phi_{0}^{(0)}(z)\right]^{2} , \quad i = 1, 2$$

Demanding regularity at the horizon, we fix the normalization constant c,

$$\frac{1}{c^2} = \frac{\Gamma(2 - \frac{2\Delta}{d})\Gamma^2(\frac{\Delta}{d})}{(d - 2\Delta)\Gamma(\frac{2\Delta}{d})\Gamma^2(1 - \frac{\Delta}{d})}a_1 - a_2$$

In the zero temperature limit ( $b \rightarrow \infty$ ), rescale  $z \rightarrow z/b$ ,

$$a_{1} = \frac{1}{b^{2\Delta+2-d}} \int_{0}^{\infty} dz \, z^{2\Delta-1} \left[ K_{\nu} \left( \frac{z^{\Delta}}{\Delta} \right) \right]^{2} + \dots, \ a_{2} = \frac{1}{(d-2\Delta)b^{2}} \int_{0}^{\infty} dz \, z^{d-1} \left[ K_{\nu} \left( \frac{z^{\Delta}}{\Delta} \right) \right]^{2} + \dots$$
  
Evidently, for  $\Delta < \frac{d}{2}, \ a_{2}/a_{1} \to 0$  as  $b \to \infty$ , therefore

$$c^{2} = Cb^{2\Delta + 2-d}, \quad C = \frac{4\sin\pi\nu}{(d-2)\pi} \frac{(d-2\Delta)\Gamma(\frac{2\Delta}{d})\Gamma^{2}(1-\frac{\Delta}{d})}{\Gamma(2-\frac{2\Delta}{d})\Gamma^{2}(\frac{\Delta}{d})}$$

Estimate higher-order corrections...

**George Siopsis** 

### Define the ratios

$$\epsilon(b) = \frac{\int_0^1 \frac{dz}{1-z^d} z^{2\Delta+1-d} \Phi_0^{(0)\,2} (1-F_0^{(0)}) F_0^{(0)}}{\int_0^1 \frac{dz}{1-z^d} z^{2\Delta+1-d} \Phi_0^{(0)\,2} F_0^{(0)}}$$

which scales as  $\mathcal{O}(b^{2\Delta-d})$ , and

$$\epsilon'(b) = \frac{\int_0^1 dz \, z^{3-d} \frac{(bz)^{2\Delta} \Phi_0^{(0)\,2}}{1-z^d} \left[ F_0^{(0)\,2} - 1 + z^{d-2} \right]}{\int_0^1 dz \, z^{3-d} \frac{(bz)^{2\Delta} \Phi_0^{(0)\,2}}{1-z^d}}$$

which scales as  $\mathcal{O}(b^{2-d})$ . Both vanish in the limit  $b \to \infty$  - confirmed numerically.



The ratios  $\epsilon$  (left panel) and  $\epsilon'$  (right panel) in the low temperature limit  $(b \to \infty)$ , for  $\Delta = 1$ and d = 3.

► above results validate our perturbative expansion. charge density

$$\rho_0 \sim b^{\frac{d}{2} + \Delta - 1}$$

Using

$$\frac{\langle \mathcal{O}_{\Delta} \rangle^{1/\Delta}}{T_c} \sim b \rho_0^{-\frac{1}{d-1}} \ , \quad \frac{T}{T_c} \sim \rho_0^{-\frac{1}{d-1}}$$

we finally obtain

$$\frac{\langle \mathcal{O}_{\Delta} \rangle^{1/\Delta}}{T_c} = \gamma \left(\frac{T}{T_c}\right)^{-\frac{d/2 - \Delta}{d/2 + \Delta - 1}}$$

- ► condensate diverges as  $T \rightarrow 0$ .
- exponent depends on the dimensions of the operator and spacetime.
- $\blacktriangleright$  constant of proportionality  $\gamma$  can be found analytically.



The parameter  $\gamma$  vs  $\Delta$ . Curve on left (right) is for d = 3 (d = 4).

**George Siopsis** 

As 
$$\Delta \rightarrow \frac{d}{2}$$
 (BF bound),  $\gamma \rightarrow 0$ ,

.:. power law behavior changes

Letting  $\Delta = \frac{d}{2} - \varepsilon$ ,

$$\frac{1}{c^2} = \frac{(d-2)\pi}{4\sin\frac{2\pi}{d}} \left[ \frac{1}{2\varepsilon b^{2-2\varepsilon}} - \frac{1}{2\varepsilon b^2} + \dots \right]$$

and taking the limit  $\varepsilon \rightarrow 0$ , we deduce at the BF bound

$$\frac{c^2}{b^2} = \frac{4\sin\frac{2\pi}{d}}{\pi(d-2)[\ln b + \beta_d + o(b^0)]}$$

where  $\beta_d$  is a constant that depends on the dimension and is easily computed (e.g., for d = 3,  $\beta_3 \approx 1.75$ ).

Higher-order corrections are estimated as before.

- we obtain,  $\epsilon \sim 1/\ln b$  and  $\epsilon' \sim 1/b^{d-2}$ 
  - also confirmed by a numerical calculation.
- higher-order corrections are indeed sub-leading in low temperature limit.

For the charge density,

$$ho_0 \sim b^{d-1} (\ln b)^{-1/2}$$

and the condensate

$$\frac{\langle \mathcal{O}_{\Delta} \rangle^{1/\Delta}}{T_c} \sim (\ln b)^{\frac{1}{2(d-1)}} \sim \left( \ln \frac{T_c}{T} \right)^{\frac{1}{2(d-1)}}$$

showing that the condensate diverges at the BF bound, albeit very mildly.

▶ mild divergence was missed in earlier numerical studies.



The field *F* for  $\Delta = 1.2$  (left panel), 1.4 (middle panel), 1.5 (right panel) and d = 3. Upper curves are from first-order analytic expression and exact numerical results (almost indistinguishable) at  $T/T_c \approx 0.1$ ; lower dashed curves are the T = 0 limit (unattainable numerically).



The field *F* for  $\Delta = 1.6$  (left panel), 1.8 (middle panel), 2 (right panel) and d = 4. Above the BF bound ( $\Delta > d/2$ ), as  $T \to 0$ , we have  $F_0 \approx 1$  near the boundary ( $z \leq 1/b$ ), but asymptotically (large  $z \gtrsim 1/b$ ),  $F_0 \sim (bz)^{d-2\Delta}$ , which does not have a smooth limit as  $T \to 0$ .

- cannot apply perturbation theory
- instead, one can approximate  $F_0$  by

$$F_{0}(z) = \begin{cases} 1 & , z \leq \alpha/b \\ \left(\frac{bz}{\alpha}\right)^{d-2\Delta} & , z > \alpha/b \end{cases}$$

and find  $\alpha$  by a variational method.

## first-order corections in a $1/q^2$ expansion.

For  $\Delta < d/2$ , it is necessary to include corrections to obtain a physical system at low temperatures,

 $\therefore$  in the  $q \to \infty$  limit the condensate diverges as  $T \to 0$ .

At first order, we obtain for the functions determining the metric,

$$zf'_{1} - df_{1} = \frac{(bz)^{2\Delta}}{4(d-1)} \left[ \left( m^{2} + \Delta^{2}f_{0} + \frac{z^{2}\Phi_{0}^{2}}{(bz)^{2\Delta}} \right) F_{0}^{2} + 2\Delta zf_{0}F_{0}F_{0}' + z^{2}f_{0}F_{0}'^{2} + \frac{z^{4}}{(bz)^{2\Delta}}\Phi_{0}'^{2} \right]$$
$$z\chi_{1}' = \frac{(bz)^{2\Delta}}{d-1} \left[ \left( \Delta^{2} + \frac{z^{2}\Phi_{0}^{2}}{f_{0}^{2}} \right) F_{0}^{2} + 2\Delta zF_{0}F_{0}' + z^{2}F_{0}'^{2} \right]$$

Solution

$$f_1(z) = -\frac{\Delta}{4(d-1)} (bz)^{2\Delta} \left[ 2 - z^d - z^{d-2\Delta} \right] + \dots, \ \chi_1(z) = -\frac{\Delta}{2(d-1)} (bz)^{2\Delta} + \dots$$

For the temperature, we deduce the first-order expression

$$T = \frac{d}{4\pi} \left[ 1 + \frac{\Delta^2}{2d(d-1)} \frac{b^{2\Delta}}{q^2} + \dots \right]$$

temperature receives a positive correction away from the probe limit.

probe limit fails: for the expansion in  $1/q^2$  to be valid, we ought to have

$$b \lesssim q^{1/\Delta}$$

For a given q, this places a lower bound on the temperature.

- While T = 0 is unattainable for finite q, T can be made arbitrarily low by choosing a sufficiently large q.
- even though the probe limit  $(q \rightarrow \infty)$  is not a physical system, its properties are a good approximation to corresponding properties of physical systems (of finite q).
  - approximation becomes better with increasing q and the  $1/q^2$  expansion is valid.

# Conductivity

26

## Low Temperature Conductivity

We shall obtain the conductivity  $\sigma$  as a function of the rescaled frequency

$$\widehat{\omega} = \frac{\omega}{b} = \frac{\omega}{\langle \mathcal{O}_{\Delta} \rangle^{1/\Delta}}$$

The function  $\sigma(\hat{\omega})$  has a well-defined limit as  $q \to \infty$  (probe limit) down to zero temperature even though the condensate  $\langle \mathcal{O}_{\Delta} \rangle$  diverges.

► The probe limit, which is not a physical state at low temperatures, can be arbitrarily well approximated by physical states of sufficiently large *q*. The conductivity of these states can be obtained as a  $1/q^2$  expansion with the conductivity in the probe limit serving as the zeroth order term in the expansion.

d = 3

The conductivity on the AdS boundary is found by applying a sinusoidal electromagnetic perturbation in the bulk of frequency  $\omega$  obeying the wave equation

$$-\frac{d^2A}{dr_*^2} + VA = \omega^2 A \ , \quad V = \frac{2q^2}{z^2} f \Psi^2$$

where A is any component of the perturbing electromagnetic potential along the boundary.

**George Siopsis** 

▶ ingoing boundary condition at the horizon

$$A \sim e^{-i\omega r_*} \sim (1-z)^{-i\omega/3}$$

as  $z \to 1$   $(r_* \to -\infty)$ , where  $r_*$  is the tortoise coordinate

$$r_* = \int \frac{dz}{f(z)} = \frac{1}{6} \left[ \ln \frac{(1-z)^3}{1-z^3} - 2\sqrt{3} \tan^{-1} \frac{\sqrt{3}z}{2+z} \right]$$

with the integration constant chosen so that the boundary is at  $r_* = 0$ . wave equation reads

$$\frac{d}{dz}\left[(1-z^3)\frac{dA}{dz}\right] - \left[b^{2\Delta}z^{2\Delta-2}F^2(z) - \frac{\omega^2}{1-z^3}\right]A = 0$$

set

$$A = (1-z)^{-i\omega/3} e^{-i\omega z/3} \mathcal{A}(z)$$

▶ included a factor  $e^{-i\omega z/3}$  so that only  $\mathcal{A}(z)$  contributes to conductivity.

wave equation becomes

$$-3(1-z^{3})\mathcal{A}'' + z \left[9z - 2(1+z+z^{2})i\omega\right]\mathcal{A}' + \left[3b^{2\Delta}z^{2\Delta-2}F^{2}(z) - (1+2z+3z^{2})i\omega - \frac{(3+2z+z^{2})(3+z+z^{2}+z^{3})}{3(1+z+z^{2})}\omega^{2}\right]\mathcal{A} = 0$$

Regularity of A at horizon (z = 1) implies the b.c.

$$(3-2i\omega)\mathcal{A}'(1) + \left(b^{2\Delta}F^2(1) - 2i\omega - \frac{4\omega^2}{3}\right)\mathcal{A}(1) = 0$$

In zero temperature limit,  $b \to \infty$ , rescale  $z \to z/b$ , and solve as a series expansion in  $1/q^2$ .

zeroth order term (probe limit) by replacing F by  $F_0$ , For  $\Delta \leq \frac{3}{2}$ ,

$$-\mathcal{A}'' + \left[z^{2\Delta-2} - \hat{\omega}^2\right]\mathcal{A} = 0$$

where we used  $F(z/b) \rightarrow F(0) = 1$ , as  $b \rightarrow \infty$ . For  $1 < \Delta \leq \frac{3}{2}$ , there are two linearly independent solutions,  $A_{\pm}$ , distinguished by their asymptotic behavior,

$$\mathcal{A}_{\pm} \sim e^{\pm \frac{1}{\Delta} z^{\Delta}} , \quad z \to \infty$$

#### **George Siopsis**

The general solution can be written as a linear combination,

$$\mathcal{A} = c^+ \mathcal{A}_+ + c^- \mathcal{A}_-$$

Applying the b.c. at horizon, we deduce

$$\frac{c^+}{c^-} \sim e^{-\frac{2}{\Delta}b^{\Delta}}$$

so at zero temperature

$$c^{+} = 0$$

i.e.,  $\mathcal{A} \to 0$  as  $z \to \infty$ .

$$\Delta = 1$$

Exact solution

$$\mathcal{A}(z) = e^{-\sqrt{1-\hat{\omega}^2}bz}$$

whereas  $\mathcal{A}_+(z) = e^{+\sqrt{1-\hat{\omega}^2}bz}$ , with arbitrary normalization, where we restored the scaling parameter *b*.

**George Siopsis** 

T = 0 conductivity in probe limit

$$\sigma(\hat{\omega}) = \frac{i}{\hat{\omega}} \sqrt{1 - \hat{\omega}^2}$$

 $\Re \sigma = 0$  for  $\hat{\omega} \leq 1$ ,  $\therefore$  gap

$$\omega_g = \langle \mathcal{O}_1 \rangle$$

At low T, corrections  $\sim e^{-2b}$ , therefore

$$\Re \sigma \sim e^{-E_g/T}$$
,  $E_g = \frac{3\langle \mathcal{O}_1 \rangle}{2\pi} \approx 0.48\omega_g$ 

to be compared with the BCS result for energy gap  $E_g = \omega_g/2 = 0.50\omega_g$ .

 $\Delta = \frac{3}{2}$ 

$$\mathcal{A}(z) = \mathcal{A}_{-}(z) = \operatorname{Ai}(bz - \hat{\omega}^2)$$

whereas  $\mathcal{A}_+(z) = \operatorname{Bi}(bz - \hat{\omega}^2)$ .

At T = 0 in the probe limit, the quasinormal frequencies have moved to the

#### **George Siopsis**

real axis yielding an infinite set of normal frequencies which are solutions of

$$\operatorname{Ai}(-\widehat{\omega}^2) = 0$$

► infinite tower of real frequencies given by the zeroes of the Airy function. The T = 0 conductivity in the probe limit is

$$\sigma(\hat{\omega}) = \frac{i}{\hat{\omega}} \frac{\operatorname{Ai}'(-\hat{\omega}^2)}{\operatorname{Ai}(-\hat{\omega}^2)}$$

normal modes are the poles of conductivity.

• At zero temperature,  $\Re \sigma = 0$ , except at the poles of  $\Im \sigma$  where  $\Re \sigma$  diverges as a  $\delta$ -function. Gap

$$\omega_g \approx 1.5 \langle \mathcal{O}_{3/2} \rangle^{2/3}$$

At low temperatures,

$$\Re \sigma \sim e^{-\frac{4}{3}b^{3/2}} = e^{-(E_g/T)^{3/2}} , \quad E_g = \frac{1}{\pi} \left(\frac{3}{4}\right)^{1/3} \langle \mathcal{O}_{3/2} \rangle^{2/3} \approx 0.2\omega_g$$

to be compared with the BCS result  $E_g = 0.5\omega_g$ .

#### **George Siopsis**

For first-order correction  $\delta A$ ,

$$-\delta \mathcal{A}'' + [z - \hat{\omega}^2] \delta \mathcal{A} = -\frac{1}{3(1 - z^3)} \mathcal{H}_1 \mathcal{A}$$

where

$$\mathcal{H}_{1} = z \left[9z - 2(1+z+z^{2})i\omega\right] \frac{d}{dz} + 3b^{3}z(2F_{1}(z)+z^{3}) - (1+2z+3z^{2})i\omega + \frac{z^{2}(1-15z-12z^{2}-10z^{3})}{3(1+z+z^{2})}\omega^{2}\right]$$

T = 0 real frequencies get shifted at low T > 0 away from the real axis,

$$\delta\hat{\omega} = \frac{\pi \mathrm{Bi}(-\hat{\omega}^2)}{3\hat{\omega}\mathrm{Ai}'(-\hat{\omega}^2)} \int_0^1 \frac{dz}{1-z^3} \mathrm{Ai}(bz - \hat{\omega}^2) \mathcal{H}_1 \mathrm{Ai}(bz - \hat{\omega}^2)$$

valid for low frequencies.

- As we heat up the system, most modes disappear and we are left with a finite number of quasinormal modes. Their number decreases as we increase the temperature.
- Conversely, as we cool down the system, modes shift to the real axis  $(\delta \hat{\omega} \rightarrow 0 \text{ as } T \rightarrow 0)$ , and at T = 0 we obtain an infinite number of real frequencies.

As the mode frequency approaches the real axis, the corresponding spike in the plot of the imaginary part of the conductivity becomes more pronounced.



The imaginary part of the conductivity in d = 3 using the analytic expression for the scalar field (dotted line) compared with the exact numerical solution (solid line) at  $\frac{T}{T} \approx .1$ 

#### **George Siopsis**



The imaginary part of the conductivity *vs.* frequency in d = 3 using the analytic expression for F at  $\frac{T}{T_c} \approx .05$  (left), .04 (right). As the temperature decreases, poles move on to the real axis.



Comparison of the imaginary part of the conductivity in d = 3 using the analytic expression for F at  $\frac{T}{T_c} \approx .01$  (dotted line) and the zero temperature limit (solid line).

#### **George Siopsis**

For  $\Delta > 3/2$ , the potential is

$$V = b^{2\Delta} z^{2\Delta-2} (1-z^3) F(bz)$$

It attains a maximum of order  $b^{2(2-\Delta)}$  for  $\Delta < 2$ . Therefore, at zero temperature it has infinite height. However, the width becomes infinitely narrow leading to a finite tower of poles for the conductivity (quasinormal modes). In the zero temperature limit, the number of modes increases as one approaches the BF bound and decreases away from it.

d = 4

At BF bound,  $\Delta = 2$ , in the probe limit, wave equation

$$A'' - \frac{1}{z}A' - [b^4 z^2 - \omega^2]A = 0$$

whose acceptable solution can be written in terms of a Whittaker function,

$$A = W_{\underline{\hat{\omega}^2}_{\underline{4}}, \underline{1}_{\underline{2}}}(b^2 z^2)$$

(The other solution diverges as  $z \to \infty$ .)

At the boundary  $(z \rightarrow 0)$ , it has a logarithmic divergence which we need to subtract before we can calculate QNMs and the conductivity

[Horowitz and Roberts]

The conductivity is then given by

$$\sigma(\hat{\omega}) = \frac{2}{i\hat{\omega}}\frac{A_2}{A_0} + \frac{i\hat{\omega}}{2}$$

with an arbitrarily chosen cutoff, where

$$A(z) = A_0 + A_2 b^2 z^2 - A_0 \frac{\hat{\omega}^2}{2} b^2 z^2 \ln(b^2 z^2) + \dots$$

**George Siopsis** 

Using the expansion for small arguments,

$$W_{\frac{\hat{\omega}^2}{4},\frac{1}{2}}(b^2 z^2) = -\frac{2}{\hat{\omega}^2 \Gamma(-\hat{\omega}^2/4)} \left\{ 1 - \left[1 + \hat{\omega}^2 \left(2\gamma - 1 + \ln(b^2 z^2) + \psi(1 - \hat{\omega}^2/4)\right)\right] \frac{b^2 z^2}{2} \right\} + \dots$$

we deduce the T = 0 conductivity in the probe limit

$$\sigma(\hat{\omega}) = \frac{1}{i\hat{\omega}} + i\hat{\omega} \left[ 2\gamma - \frac{1}{2} + \psi(1 - \hat{\omega}^2/4) \right]$$

We have a pole at  $\omega = 0$ , as expected and an infinite tower of real poles determined by the poles of the digamma function,

$$\hat{\omega} = \frac{\omega_n}{\langle \mathcal{O} \rangle^{1/2}} = 2\sqrt{n} , \quad n = 0, 1, 2, \dots$$

**George Siopsis** 



 $\Im \sigma$  in d = 4 using the analytic expression for the scalar field (dotted line) compared with the exact numerical solution (solid line) at  $\frac{T}{T_c} \approx .17$ 



 $\Im \sigma$  in d = 4 using the analytic expression for F at  $\frac{T}{T_c} \approx .1$  (left), .04 (right).



 $\Im \sigma$  at T = 0 in d = 4.

### **George Siopsis**

# Varying q

## **Quantum Critical Point (Varying** *q***)**



 $\Delta = 1$  (left panel),  $\Delta = 2$  (right panel). [Hartnoll, Herzog, Horowitz] GOAL

- understand phase transition between q = 0 and  $q \rightarrow \infty$ 
  - quantum critical point at  $q \sim 1$ .
- calculate analytically (numerical analysis fails).



a)  $\Delta = 1$  (bottom to top, q = 1, 3, 6, 12), b)  $\Delta = 2$  (top to bottom, q = 3, 6, 12). [Hartnoll, Herzog, Horowitz]

 $d = 3, \Delta = 2$ 

Above the critical temperature ( $T \ge T_c$ ), we have  $\Psi = 0$  and  $\chi = 0$ . The field equations reduce to

$$\Psi'' + \left[\frac{f'}{f} - \frac{2}{z}\right]\Psi' + \left[\frac{q^2\Phi^2}{f^2} - \frac{m^2}{z^2f}\right]\Psi = 0$$
  
$$\Phi'' = 0$$
  
$$\frac{z^2}{4}{\Phi'}^2 - \frac{f'}{z} + \frac{3(f-1)}{z^2} = 0$$

The first equation has a non-zero solution only at  $T = T_c$ .

#### **George Siopsis**

The other two equations yield the RN black hole

$$f(z) = 1 - \left(1 + \frac{\rho^2}{4}\right)z^3 + \frac{\rho^2}{4}z^4$$
,  $\Phi(z) = \rho(1 - z)$ 

whose Hawking temperature is

$$T = \frac{1}{4\pi} \left( 3 - \frac{\rho^2}{4} \right)$$

To find the critical temperature  $T_c$ , we need to solve the field equation for  $\Psi$ . At extremality,

$$\frac{\rho^2}{4} = 3 \quad , \quad T_H = 0$$

The general *real* solution to the field equation is

$$\Psi = A \frac{z}{z - z_{+}} \left( \frac{z - z_{-}}{z - z_{+}} \right)^{\frac{2\sqrt{2} - i}{12}q\rho} \left( \frac{1 - z}{z - z_{+}} \right)^{\delta_{+}} F\left( -\delta_{-} + \frac{\sqrt{2}}{3}q\rho, -\delta_{-} - \frac{iq\rho}{6}; -2\delta_{-}; \frac{2i(2\sqrt{2} - i)(z - 1)}{9(z - z_{+})} \right) + \text{c.c.}$$

where  $z_{\pm}$  are the roots of f(z) that are distinct from the horizon ( $z_{\pm} \neq 1$ ) and

$$\delta_{\pm} = -\frac{1}{2} \pm i \frac{\sqrt{3 + (q\rho)^2}}{6}$$

**George Siopsis** 

are the dimensions of a scalar field in AdS<sub>2</sub> space of effective mass

$$m_{\text{eff}}^2 = m^2 + g^{tt}q^2\Phi^2 = -2 - \frac{(q\rho)^2}{6}$$

The radius of the AdS<sub>2</sub> space is  $R = 1/\sqrt{6}$ .

Since both dimensions are complex, neither solution is regular at the horizon.

• in accord with the fact that we are below the BF bound in AdS<sub>2</sub> space.

Near extremality, set

$$\frac{\sigma^2}{4} = 3 - \epsilon$$
,  $T = T_c = \frac{\epsilon}{4\pi}$ 

Above T = 0 result still approximately valid away from the horizon. Near the horizon, perform the coordinate transformation

$$z = 1 - \frac{\epsilon}{6}\zeta$$

The metric becomes

$$ds^{2} = \frac{1}{6\zeta^{2}} \left[ -\epsilon^{2} \zeta (1+\zeta) dt^{2} + \frac{d\zeta^{2}}{\zeta (1+\zeta)} \right] + d\vec{x}^{2} + \dots$$

**George Siopsis** 

where we omitted higher-order terms in  $\epsilon$ . The electrostatic potential reads

$$\Phi = \frac{\rho\epsilon}{6}\zeta + \dots$$

and the field equation for the scalar field  $\Psi$  near the horizon becomes

$$\zeta(1+\zeta)\Psi'' + (2\zeta+1)\Psi' + \frac{1}{3}\left[1 + \frac{(q\rho)^2}{12}\frac{\zeta}{1+\zeta}\right]\Psi = 0$$

where prime denotes differentiation with respect to  $\zeta$ . The acceptable solution is

$$\Psi(\zeta) = (1+\zeta)^{-iq\rho/6} F\left(-\delta_{+} - \frac{iq\rho}{6}, -\delta_{-} - \frac{iq\rho}{6}; 1; -\zeta\right)$$

arbitrarily normalized so that at the horizon  $\Psi(0) = 1$ . The other solution is discarded because it has a logarithmic singularity at the horizon.

It is easily deduced from the identity

$$F(\alpha,\beta;\gamma;x) = (1-x)^{\gamma-\alpha-\beta}F(\gamma-\alpha,\gamma-\beta;\gamma;x)$$

that  $\Psi$  is real,

$$\Psi = (1+\zeta)^{iq\rho/6} F\left(-\delta_{-} + \frac{iq\rho}{6}, -\delta_{+} + \frac{iq\rho}{6}; 1; -\zeta\right) = \Psi^{*}$$

As  $\zeta \to \infty$ , we obtain

$$\Psi \approx \frac{\Gamma(-1-2\delta_{+})}{\Gamma(-\delta_{+}+\frac{iq\rho}{6})\Gamma(-\delta_{+}-\frac{iq\rho}{6})}\zeta^{\delta_{-}} + \frac{\Gamma(-1-2\delta_{-})}{\Gamma(-\delta_{-}+\frac{iq\rho}{6})\Gamma(-\delta_{-}-\frac{iq\rho}{6})}\zeta^{\delta_{+}}$$

to be compared with the near horizon limit of the other expression,

$$\Psi \sim A(1-z_+)^{\delta_-} \left(\frac{1-z_-}{1-z_+}\right)^{\frac{2\sqrt{2}-i}{12}q\rho} (1-z)^{\delta_+} + \text{c.c.}$$

We obtain

$$A = \frac{\Gamma(-1 - 2\delta_{-})}{\Gamma(-\delta_{-} + \frac{iq\rho}{6})\Gamma(-\delta_{-} - \frac{iq\rho}{6})} \left(\frac{\epsilon}{6}\right)^{-\delta_{+}} (1 - z_{+})^{-\delta_{-}} \left(\frac{1 - z_{+}}{1 - z_{-}}\right)^{\frac{2\sqrt{2} - i}{12}q\rho}$$

#### **George Siopsis**

At the boundary, we have  $\Psi \sim z^2$ , therefore

$$A(-z_{+})^{\delta_{-}} \left(\frac{z_{-}}{z_{+}}\right)^{\frac{2\sqrt{2}-i}{12}q\rho} F\left(-\delta_{-} + \frac{\sqrt{2}}{3}q\rho, -\delta_{-} - \frac{iq\rho}{6}; -2\delta_{-}; -2z_{+}\right) + \text{c.c.} = 0$$

$$\boxed{\mathsf{q}=\mathsf{0}}$$

$$\left(\frac{\epsilon}{6}\right)^{\delta_{+}-\delta_{-}} = -\frac{C}{C^{*}}, \quad C = \frac{\Gamma(-1-2\delta_{-})}{\Gamma^{2}(-\delta_{-})} \left(\frac{z_{+}}{z_{+}-1}\right)^{\delta_{-}} F(-\delta_{-}, -\delta_{-}; -2\delta_{-}; -2z_{+})$$

We have

$$\ln \frac{-C}{C^*} \approx 2i + 2\pi ni \quad , \quad n \in \mathbb{Z}$$

To find a small  $\epsilon$ , we choose n = -1 and obtain

$$\epsilon \approx 0.004$$

and the critical temperature is

$$T_c = \frac{\epsilon}{4\pi} \approx 3.2 \times 10^{-4} , \quad \frac{T_c}{\sqrt{\rho}} = \frac{3.2 \times 10^{-4}}{12^{1/4}} \approx 1.7 \times 10^{-4}$$

**George Siopsis** 

Below the critical temperature, we have  $\chi' = z \Psi'^2$ , and since  $\chi(0) = 0$ ,

$$\chi(z) = \int_0^z dz' z' (\Psi'(z'))^2$$

The Maxwell equation reads  $\Phi'' + \frac{\chi'}{2}\Phi' = 0$  with solution

$$\Phi' = -\rho e^{-\chi/2}$$

Since  $\Phi(1) = 0$ , we obtain

$$\Phi(z) = \rho \int_z^1 dz' e^{-\chi(z')/2}$$

The other two field equations are

$$\Psi'' + \left[\frac{f'}{f} - \frac{z{\Psi'}^2}{2} - \frac{2}{z}\right]\Psi' + \frac{2}{z^2 f}\Psi = 0$$
  
$$\frac{f}{2}{\Psi'}^2 + \frac{\rho^2}{4}z^2 - \frac{f'}{z} + \frac{3(f-1)}{z^2} - \frac{\Psi^2}{z^2} = 0$$

to be solved for  $\Psi$  and f.

**George Siopsis** 

At the horizon (z = 1), we obtain

$$\frac{1}{4\pi}\Psi^2(1) = Te^{\chi(1)/2} - T_{RN}$$

where  $T = -\frac{f'(1)}{4\pi}e^{-\chi(1)/2}$  is the temperature of the hairy black hole,  $T_{RN}$  is the temperature of the RN black hole with the same charge density, and we used f(1) = 0.

Right below  $T_c$ , use perturbation to find corrections to the fields given that  $\Psi$  is small. We obtain

$$\langle \mathcal{O}_2 \rangle = \gamma T_c^2 \sqrt{1 - \frac{T}{T_c}}$$

where  $\gamma$  is a constant that can be calculated using the explicit form of  $\Psi$ . The T = 0 limit is obtained in the limit  $\rho \to \infty$ . Moreover, we expect

$$\Psi \approx \frac{\langle \mathcal{O}_2 \rangle}{\sqrt{2}} z^2$$

throughout.

We obtain

$$\langle \mathcal{O}_2 \rangle = \frac{\rho}{\sqrt{2}}$$

Therefore,

$$\frac{\sqrt{\langle \mathcal{O}_2 \rangle}}{T_c} \approx \frac{1}{1.7 \times 10^{-4} \times 2^{1/4}} \approx 5 \times 10^3$$

a very large number indeed!

# Conclusions

- Gravity provides a *dual* description of superconductors at strong coupling.
- used analytic techniques to probe low temperature physics where numerical instabilities arise, in order to understand the *ground state* of these systems
- Found that, in the probe limit, the condensate diverges at the BF bound (albeit very mildly) and conductivity has an infinite number of poles whose positions we determined analytically.
- Found analytic relation between energy gap  $E_g$  and frequency gap in the conductivity  $\omega_g$  which differs from BCS  $E_g = \omega_g/2$ .
- Developed analytic tools to probe possible quantum critical points (as one varies the charge of the scalar field q or the dimension of the condensate  $\Delta$ ).
- A lot of work remains to be done toward a more realistic description, e.g., by incorporating spatial dependence to account for the lattice structure, doping, etc.